

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Supplemental Digital Appendix 5

Relevance of Compassion Education Interventions to the Domains of Compassion Delineated by the Patient Compassion Model³²

Reference	Learner type	Teaching modality (i.e., details of the program)	Intended patient population	Domains of compassion					
				Virtuous response ^a	Seeking to understand ^b	Attending to needs ^c	Relational communication ^d	Relational space ^e	
Education setting									
Formal curriculum based education									
Ellman MS 2016 ⁴¹	Medical students (N = 50-200)	Curriculum in End of Life care using experiential, skill-building activities with special attention to student self-reflection (4-years).	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	✓	—	—	—
Costello M 2017 ⁴²	Nursing students	Care at the End of Life using Watson's publications, videos, lectures, guest speakers, discussion, assignments and projects.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—	—
Brown JS 2015 ⁴³	Critical care nurses (N = 30)	An HIV/AIDS palliative care course delivered in a traditional conference/ Classroom.	HIV/AIDS palliative care	✓	—	—	—	—	—
Shih CY 2013 ⁴⁴	Preclinical medical students (N = 251)	Palliative care training course.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—	—
Anandarajah G 2016 ⁴⁵	Residents/physicians (N = 26)	Spiritual care curriculum.	Family medicine	✓	—	—	—	—	—
Anderson JG 2016 ⁴⁶	Registered nurses (N = 24)	Healing Touch.	Acute care patients	✓	—	—	—	—	—
Aggarwal AK 2013 ⁴⁷	Medical students (N = 250)	A student led curriculum entitled "Mental Illness Among Us" involving panels presentations and discussions.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—	—
Camp CL, 2010 ⁴⁸	First year medical students enrolled	Delivering feedback.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordons AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

	in gross anatomy (N = 49)							
Frazier M 2015 ⁴⁹	First year medical students UCLA (N = 166)	Students shadowed chaplains at a hospital.	Hospitalized patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Konkin J 2011 ⁵⁰	Medical students (N = 25)	Integrated Community Clerkship with guiding principles of continuity of care, preceptor and learning environment.	Family medicine	✓	—	—	—	—
Teskereci G 2020 ⁵¹	First year nursing students (N = 73)	Caring Behavior Nursing course	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Chambliss C, 1990 ⁵²	AIDS / HIV Staff (N = 6-18)	Interactive training program	HIV/AIDS	✓	—	—	—	—
Krajewski A 2013 ⁵³	Postgraduate year 1 general surgery categorical and preliminary residents (N = 108)	Intern boot camp curriculum	Surgical patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Clinically based education interventions								
<i>Service learning</i>								
Brown KM 2017 ⁵⁴	Nursing students (N = 45)	Service-learning nursing course focused on older adults.	Older adults with cognitive and/or physical limitations	✓	—	—	—	—
Nagle BJ 2018 ⁵⁵	Medical students (N = 12)	In-home visits with geriatric patients.	Elderly patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Pate JD 2013 ⁵⁶	Nursing students (N = 65)	Elder care practicum involving increased intergenerational exposure (3 extended visits).	Elderly patients	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordons AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Redfield CS 2016 ⁵⁷	Nursing students (N = 63)	Meetings with high-functioning older adults to provide brief health promotion activities.	Elderly patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Davis LI 2015 ⁵⁸	Pharmacy and nursing students (N = 16)	Clinical practice in community clinics and hospital units.	Underserved communities	✓	—	—	—	—
Baldacchino DR 2010 ⁵⁹	BSc (Hons) nursing/midwifery students (N = 31)	Theory and pilgrimage.	Pilgrims in Lourdes	✓	—	—	—	—
Dhital R 2015 ⁶⁰	Third year medical students in Nepal (N = 55)	Postings in rural Primary Health Care Centers.	Underserved communities	✓	—	—	—	—
Clark DL 2003 ⁶¹	Medical Students (N = 221)	A service learning program 1) social hour 2) clinic and 3) reflection.	Homeless	✓	—	—	—	—
Levine MA 2009 ⁶²	Nursing students (N = 10)	Hands-on nursing care in a host community.	Community	✓	—	—	—	—
Smith JK 2006 ⁶³	Pre-clinical medical students (N = 66)	Lectures, workshops, and international practicum.	Underserved communities	✓	—	—	—	—
Schneider AR 2018 ⁶⁴	Nursing professors and students (N = 19)	A service-learning partnership between a university nursing program and an isolated community of internally-displaced persons.	Internally-displaced persons	✓	—	—	—	—
Whelan M 2018 ⁶⁵	Nurse practitioner and doctor of nursing practice students	Short term international health mission from USA to Jamaica.	Underserved communities	✓	—	—	—	—
Rubin RW 2004 ⁶⁶	Dental students (N = 61)	Non-dental community service.	Community	✓	—	—	—	—
Romem P 2008 ⁶⁷	Nursing students (N = 136)	A psychiatric clinical clerkship.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Crandell CE 2013 ⁶⁸	Doctor of physical therapy students (N = 8)	Service-learning clinics including student provision of faculty supervised pro bono services.	Physical therapy	✓	—	—	—	—
Hayward KS 2003 ⁶⁹	Nursing students (N = 8-10)	Case management, support services, police ride-alongs, shelter admission and intervention and research development.	Victims of domestic violence	✓	—	—	—	—
Leadership programs								
Bridges J 2015; 2017;2018 ⁷⁰ -72	Nurses (248 nurses, 639 patients, 188 visitors)	Leadership and team work practices.	Acute hospital settings	✓	—	—	✓	—
Dewar B 2010, 2014, 2017 ⁷³⁻⁷⁵	Nurses; nursing staff (N = 86); care home staff and residents (N = 48)	Appreciative action research.	Acute hospital setting/residents and families of residents in care homes	✓	—	—	✓	—
Saab MM 2019 ⁷⁶	Nursing and midwifery leaders (N = 79-168)	Leaders for Compassionate Care Programme.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
End of life care								
Chan B 2018 ⁷⁷	Registered nurses (N = 51)	Workshop on the CARE Program.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—
Moore KJ 2017 ⁷⁸	Nursing home and external health care professionals (N = 10-19)	Staff training by an interdisciplinary care leader.	Residents and families of residents with dementia in nursing homes	✓	—	✓	—	—
Other patient populations								
Carson NE 2017 ⁷⁹	Caregivers (n = 51) and students (n = 170)	Caregivers Are Heroes, caregiver interviews.	Chronic illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Baran Stecker M	Nurses (N = 25)	Didactic lectures and case-base scenarios.	Patients with epilepsy	✓	—	✓	✓	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordons AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

2011;
Stecker M
2012^{80,81}

Studentships								
Jeste DV 2018 ⁸²	First year medical students participating in a multi-site program MSTAR or single site M-STREAM (N = 178)	Summer research training program combined mentored research, didactics, and some clinical exposure.	Elderly patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Lefresne S 2011 ⁸³	Clinical nutrition students, medical students and supervising oncologists	Summer Studentship in Palliative and Supportive Care in Oncology.	Patients with cancer	✓	—	—	—	—
Teaching approaches								
Self-reflection								
Hawthornth waite L 2018 ⁸⁴	Registered nurses (N = 542)	A 2-part workshop with patients and supporting patient and family storytellers	Family medicine	✓	—	—	—	—
Adamson E 2015 ⁸⁵	Student nurses	Stories gathered within clinical practice used to stimulate reflective learning.	Acute care	✓	—	—	—	—
Clandinin DJ 2008 ⁸⁶	Family medicine residents (N = 4)	Writing, sharing and inquiring into parallel charts.	Primary care	✓	—	—	—	—
Scamell M 2017 ⁸⁷	First year undergraduate midwifery (N = 111)	Online storytelling.	Maternal and neonatal	✓	—	—	—	—
Waugh A 2016 ⁸⁸	Nursing students (N = 13)	Digital narratives of compassionate care.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Begley AM 2011 ⁸⁹	Post-graduate nursing students (N = 24)	Tolstoy's "Death of Ivan Ilych" used as a stimulus for discussion.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Deloney LA 2003 ⁹⁰	First Year Medical Students (N = 138)	Pre-play lecture on end-of-life care, watching the drama Wit and a post-play discussion with the cast.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—
Adam D 2014 ⁹¹	Nursing students (N = 30)	A learning module "Understanding self in relation to others in professional practice" using class discussion and formative reflections.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Wiklund Gustin L 2013 ⁹²	Nursing teachers (N = 4)	Experiential and reflective work to understand self-compassion as a source to compassionate care.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Reisman AB 2006 ⁹³	Residents (N = 15)	Workshop on writing in medicine.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Fresa-Dillon KL 2004 ⁹⁴	Osteopathic medical students	Creation of a class vision statement reflective.	Osteopathy	✓	—	—	—	—
Jack K 2015 ⁹⁵	Nursing students (N = 42)	Poetry writing on important practice issues.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Shapiro J 2003 ⁹⁶	Medical students and residents	Small-group learning experiences and use of creative projects, such as poetry, to reflect on patients and themselves.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Shapiro J 2006 ⁹⁷	Medical students (N = 11)	Learning from role models and peer; in-class readings; self- and other-observation; self-reflective techniques; case-based problem solving.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Coleman D 2015 ⁹⁸	Adult and mental health pre- registration student nurses (N = 10)	Students wrote poetry, which was discussed in reflective practice assessments.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
De Souza JM 2014 ⁹⁹	Cancer nurses	Family sculpting.	Patients with cancer	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Petkari E 2017 ¹⁰⁰	Psychology students (N = 26)	Movie-based education and related discussions.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Arnold BL 2016 ¹⁰¹	Palliative physicians (N = 147)	A qualitative visual analysis of 75 images.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—
Karkabi K 2014 ¹⁰²	Physicians or physicians-in-training (N = 23)	A workshop aiming to enhance reflective capacity in medical educators by using a combination of abstract paintings and narratives.	Family medicine	✓	—	—	—	—
Newell GC 2003 ¹⁰³	Residents and medical students (15-20 per session)	A "music and medicine" course.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Penson RT 2010 ¹⁰⁴	Clinicians (>50,000 clinicians at 195 sites in 31 states)	Evidence-based interdisciplinary discussions.	Multidisciplinary	✓	—	—	—	—
Farr M 2017 ¹⁰⁵	Community and mental health providers (N = 206)	Evidence-based interdisciplinary discussions.	Community and individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Gishen F 2016 ¹⁰⁶	Medical students (N = 677)	Evidence-based interdisciplinary discussions.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
<i>Clinical simulation</i>								
Loomis J 2017 ¹⁰⁷	Nursing students (N = 110)	Poverty simulation.	Underserved communities	✓	—	—	—	—
Johnson KE 2015 ¹⁰⁸	Nursing students	A poverty simulation exercise.	Underserved communities	✓	—	—	—	—
Mal F 2016 ¹⁰⁹	Nursing students (N = 18)	Case study vs. Simulation.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—
Betcher D 2010 ¹¹⁰	Nurses	Didactic lecture on communication techniques, role-playing, simulation, and discussion.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Ross AJ 2013 ¹¹¹	Health care professionals	2-day simulation training program.	Elderly patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Kalish R 2011 ¹¹²	Medical students (N = 11)	Reflection of annotated videotapes of clinical encounters.	Rheumatology	✓	—	—	✓	—
Riches S 2019 ¹¹³	Trainees or qualified clinical psychologists (N = 15-25)	Auditory hallucinations simulation.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Hayes C 2018 ¹¹⁴	Second-year undergraduate nursing students (N = 528)	Role-play simulation.	Not provided	✓	—	—	✓	—
Role modeling								
Blanco MA 2013 ¹¹⁵	Medical residents (N = 41)	Resident-as-teacher role-model program.	Rheumatology	✓	—	—	—	—
Contemplative practices								
Bell T 2017 ¹¹⁶	Trainee cognitive-behavioral therapists (N = 8)	Development of a 'compassionate internal supervisor.'	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Gale C 2017 ¹¹⁷	Mental therapists (N = 10)	Compassion focused therapy.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Mascaro JS 2016 ¹¹⁸	Second year medical students (N = 32)	Cognitively-based compassion training.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Beaumont E 2017 ¹¹⁹	Post graduate students in Cognitive Behavioural Psychotherapy (N = 21)	Compassionate mind training.	Psychotherapy	—	—	—	—	—
McEwan K, 2020 ¹²⁰	Mental health professionals (N = 17-28)	Compassionate mind training.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Weingartner LA 2019 ¹²¹	Preclinical second-year and	Compassion cultivation training.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

	fourth-year medical students (N = 45)							
Fortney L 2013 ¹²²	Primary-care physicians (N = 30)	Abbreviated mindfulness training course.	Primary care	—	—	—	—	—
Kemper KJ 2015 ¹²³	Medical students (N = 6)	Mindfulness -based stress reduction course.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Mahon MA 2017 ¹²⁴	Registered nurses (N = 90)	Mindfulness meditation.	Hospitalized patients	✓	—	—	—	—
Kemper KJ 2015 ¹²⁵	Medical, nursing, social work students and dieticians and residents (N = 60)	Mind body skills training.	Multidisciplina ry	✓	—	—	—	—
Kemper KJ 2017 ¹²⁶	Health professionals and trainees (N = 149)	Online mind-body skills training.	Multidisciplina ry	✓	—	—	—	—
Nguyen MC 2020 ¹²⁷	Residents and faculty volunteers from emergency medicine, internal medicine and surgery (N = 66)	Mind-body skills training.	Multidisciplina ry	✓	—	—	—	—
Boellinghaus I 2013 ¹²⁸	Trainee psychological therapists (N = 12)	Loving kindness meditation	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—
Rao N 2017 ¹²⁹	Nurses, physicians and social workers (N = 177)	3 types of positive emotion- generating meditation.	Multidisciplina ry	✓	—	—	—	—
Suyi Y 2017 ¹³⁰	Mental health professionals (N = 37)	Mindfulness program.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

Schroeder DA 2018 ¹³¹	Physicians (N = 33)	Brief mindfulness-based intervention.	Primary care	✓	—	—	—	—
Orellana-Rios CL 2017 ¹³²	Interdisciplinary palliative care teams (N = 28)	Mindfulness- and meditation-based intervention, including loving-kindness and Tonglen meditation training.	Palliative and EOL care	✓	—	—	—	—
Richards TA 2006 ¹³³	Registered nurses (N = 24)	Spiritually based self-management.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Kemper KJ 2017 ¹³⁴	Faculty, staff, or in training at Ohio State University's Center for Integrative Health and Wellness (N = 24)	Guided imagery, acupuncture and Reiki.	Multidisciplinary	✓	—	—	—	—
Keng S-J 2017 ¹³⁵	Therapist trainees (N = 25)	Functional analytic psychotherapy therapist training.	Psychotherapy	✓	—	—	—	—
Brathovde A 2017 ¹³⁶	Registered nurses (N = 24)	Reiki energy therapy.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Moffatt-Bruce SD 2019 ¹³⁷	Residents and faculty of cardiovascular ICU (N = 66)	A "flipped" classroom mindfulness training.	ICU	✓	—	—	—	—
Verweij H 2016 ¹³⁸	General practitioners (N = 50)	Mindfulness	Primary care	✓	—	—	—	—
Verweij H 2018 ¹³⁹	Residents (N = 148)	Mindfulness	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Other interventions								
Crow SM 2012 ¹⁴⁰	Medical students (N = 157)	Donor Luncheon before a dissection class.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Talarico EF 2013 ¹⁴¹	Medical students	Students interact with the families of the deceased persons whom they are dissecting.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Chiou RJ 2017 ¹⁴²	Medical students (N = 158)	Initiation ceremony to commemorate a donor and	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ordon AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.

		lay a wreath before a dissection class.						
Han A 2017 ¹⁴³	Staff in care facility for people with dementia (N = 24)	Compassionate touch training.	Individuals with dementia	✓	—	—	—	—
Altamirano-Bustamante MM 2013 ¹⁴⁴	Health care personnel (N = 2,891)	Clinical ethics course.	Multidisciplinary	✓	—	—	—	—
Hofmeyer A 2018 ¹⁴⁵	Nursing students	Online compassion module.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Turnbull P 2013 ¹⁴⁶	Nursing students (N = 284)	Student nurse pledge.	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Reynolds LM 2019 ¹⁴⁷	Medical students and qualified health care professionals (N = 327)	2-min compassion condition slideshow	Not provided	✓	—	—	—	—
Bunyan M 2017 ¹⁴⁸	Nurses working in mental health inpatient rehabilitation wards (N = 19)	Motivational interviewing.	Individuals with mental illness	✓	✓	—	✓	—

Abbreviations: CARE, Compassion and Respect at the End-of-life; CME, continuing medical education; EOL, end-of-life; HIV/AIDS, human immunodeficiency virus /acquired immunodeficiency syndrome; USA, United States of America.

^aVirtuous response (the activation and enactment of a virtue, defined as a good or noble quality embodied in the character of the caregiver, toward a person in need): knowing the person; person as a priority, and beneficence.

^bSeeking to understand (the extent to which caregivers attempt to understand the sufferer as a person and to understand the person's unique needs in order to optimize the effect of compassion).

^cAttending to needs (the timely, attuned desire to actively engage in and address a person's multifactorial suffering): timely action, attending and providing compassion related needs (family centered, inviting patients to share their needs, knowledgeable and comforting, etc.).

^dRelational communication (verbal and nonverbal displays of compassion conveyed through caregiver demeanor, affect, behavior, and engagement with the person in suffering).

^eRelational space (the context and content of a compassionate encounter where the person in suffering is aware and is engaged by the virtuous response of the caregiver).

Supplemental digital content for Sinclair S, Kondejewski J, Jaggi P, Dennett L, Roze des Ortons AL, Hack TF. What is the state of compassion education? A systematic review of compassion training in health care. Acad Med.