**Supplemental Table 21. Risk of bias and quality of included studies**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Checklist Cohort** | | | **Selection bias** | | | | | **Performance bias** | | **Attrition bias** | | | | **Detection bias** | | | | | | | | | | **Statistical analysis** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | | **1.2** | | | **1.3** | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | **1.9** | | **1.10** | | **1.11** | | **1.12** | **1.13** | **1.14** |  |  |
| Abelha – 2012 [1] | JWD | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 3% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ○ | + |
| Agarwal – 2010 [2] | JWD | | ● | | | ● | | ? | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | | ● | | | n/a | | ? | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Aldemir – 2001 [3] | JWD | | ? | | | n/a | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| IJZ | | ○ | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Angles – 2008 [4] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ○ | + |
| Ballestero – 2013 [5] | JWD | | n/a | | | n/a | | ? | | 0% | | ? | | ? | | ? | ? | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | n/a | | ? | | 0% | | n/a | | ? | | ? | ? | | ? | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | - |
| Boesen – 2015 [6] | RRvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| BvdL | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ○ | | ● | | ○ | ○ | ○ | ○ | - |
| Bryczkowski – 2014 [7] | RRvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Colombo – 2012 [8] | JWD | | ○ | | | ● | | ? | | ? | | ? | | ● | | ○ | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | ○ | ○ | ● | + |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ○ | ● | ● | + |
| RRvdL | | ○ | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 0 | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ○ | ● | ● | + |
| **Checklist Cohort** | | | **Selection bias** | | | | | **Performance bias** | | **Attrition bias** | | | | **Detection bias** | | | | | | | | | | **Statistical analysis** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | | **1.2** | | | **1.3** | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | **1.9** | | **1.10** | | **1.11** | | **1.12** | **1.13** | **1.14** |  |  |
| Dubois – 2001[9] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | ● | | 0% | | ● | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Ely – 2007 [10] | JWD | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | ? | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Girard - 2012 [11] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ○ | ● | ● | + |
| RRvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | ? | | n/a | | ● | | ● | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | ? | | ○ | | ● | | ● | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Guenther – 2013 [12] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 8% | | ○ | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Guillamondegui – 2011 [13] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ○ | + |
| Hayes – 2012 [14] | JWD | | ? | | | n/a | | n/a | | ? | | n/a | | ○ | | n/a | ? | | ? | | ● | | ? | ○ | ○ | ○ | - |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ? | | ? | | 0% | | n/a | | ? | | ○ | ? | | ? | | ● | | ? | ? | ● | ● | + |
| Heymann – 2007 [15] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | ? | | ● | | ● | | ? | ● | ● | ● | + |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Hsieh – 2013 [16] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 3% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kamdar – 2015 [17] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ? | | ● | | ? | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Kwizera – 2015 [18] | RRvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ? | | ● | | ? | ○ | ● | ○ | - |
| **Checklist Cohort** | | | **Selection bias** | | | | | **Performance bias** | | **Attrition bias** | | | | **Detection bias** | | | | | | | | | | **Statistical analysis** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | | **1.2** | | | **1.3** | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | **1.9** | | **1.10** | | **1.11** | | **1.12** | **1.13** | **1.14** |  |  |
| Lat – 2009 [19] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ○ | ○ | ○ | + |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | <1% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ○ | ○ | ● | - |
| Leite – 2014 [20] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ? | ? | ○ | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ? | ● | ○ | ● | + |
| Lescot – 2013 [21] | RRvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ○ | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | - |
| Limpawattana – 2016 [22] | RRvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ? | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Lin – 2008 [23] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 4% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 4% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Lin – 2015 [24] | RRvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ? | | 0 | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| McGrane – 2011 [25] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ○ | | | ● | | ○ | | 15% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| McNicoll – 2003 [26] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | ● | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ○ | + |
| RRvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 0 | | ● | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ○ | ● | ● | + |
| Mehta – 2015 [27] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | 2% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 2% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Morandi – 2011 [28] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| RRvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0 | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| **Checklist Cohort** | | | **Selection bias** | | | | | **Performance bias** | | **Attrition bias** | | | | **Detection bias** | | | | | | | | | | **Statistical analysis** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | | **1.2** | | | **1.3** | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | **1.9** | | **1.10** | | **1.11** | | **1.12** | **1.13** | **1.14** |  |  |
| Morandi – 2013 [29] | JWD | | ● | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Ouimet – 2007 [30] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| Pandharipande – 2006 [31] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| Pandharipande – 2008 [32] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| Pandharipande – 2009 [33] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ○ | ● | + |
| Pisani – 2007 [34] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ○ | ● | ● | + |
| Pisani – 2009 [35] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ○ | ● | ● | + |
| Robinson – 2009 [36] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ○ | ○ | - |
| Saporito – 2014 [37] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ? | | ● | | ? | ● | ○ | ● | - |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ? | | ● | | n/a | ● | ○ | ● | - |
| Schreiber – 2014 [38] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ● | | ? | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| Serafim – 2012 [39] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| **Checklist Cohort** | | | **Selection bias** | | | | | **Performance bias** | | **Attrition bias** | | | | **Detection bias** | | | | | | | | | | **Statistical analysis** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | | **1.2** | | | **1.3** | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | **1.9** | | **1.10** | | **1.11** | | **1.12** | **1.13** | **1.14** |  |  |
| Seymour – 2012 [40] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Sharshar – 2011 [41] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ○ | | ● | ● | ● | ○ | - |
| Shehabi – 2010 [42] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | - |
| Shehabi – 2013 [43] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Shi – 2010 [44] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Simons – 2014 [45] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ● | | ? | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | n/a | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | ● | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Skrobik – 2013[46] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ○ | | ? | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ● | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ○ | ● | + |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | n/a | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ● | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ○ | ● | + |
| Sommer – 2002 [47] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ○ | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ○ | | n/a | n/a | | ○ | | ○ | | ○ | ● | ● | ○ | - |
| Svenningsen – 2013 [48] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ○ | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Takeuchi – 2012 [49] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ○ | | ○ | ● | ● | ○ | - |
| **Checklist Cohort** | | | **Selection bias** | | | | | **Performance bias** | | **Attrition bias** | | | | **Detection bias** | | | | | | | | | | **Statistical analysis** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | | **1.2** | | | **1.3** | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | **1.9** | | **1.10** | | **1.11** | | **1.12** | **1.13** | **1.14** |  |  |
| Tsuruta – 2010 [50] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ○ | ● | ○ | + |
| van den Boogaard – 2012 [51] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ○ | ● | + |
| van den Boogaard – 2014 [52] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | n/a | n/a | n/a | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| van Rompaey – 2009 [53] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ● | | | ○ | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Veiga – 2012 [54] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | n/a | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Wassenaar – 2015 [55] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | ● | | ? | | ● | | n/a | n/a | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| Whitlock – 2014 [56] | RRvdL | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 6/10% | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | | ● | | ● | | ? | ○ | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | 6/10% | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | | ● | | ● | | ? | ○ | ● | ● | ++ |
| Wolters – 2015 [57] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| Wilson – 2012 [58] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ○ | ● | ● | ● | - |
| Yoshitaka – 2013 [59] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | n/a | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ● | n/a | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Zaal – 2012 [60] | JWD | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  |  | |  | |  | |  |  |  |  |  |
| IJZ | | ○ | | | ● | | ○ | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ○ | ● | | ● | | ● | | n/a | ● | ● | ● | + |
| Zhang – 2014 [61] | RRvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| BvdL | | n/a | | | ● | | ● | | 0% | | n/a | | ● | | ? | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | ● | ● | ● | ++ |
| **Checklist Controlled Trials** | | **Random Allocation** | | | **Concealment** | | **Blinding** | | **Successful randomisation** | | **Similar treatment groups** | | **Outcomes** | | **% dropped out** | | | **ITT analysis** | | **Comparable across sites** | | **Applicable to patient group** | **Statement** |
| **Author – Year** | **R** | **1.2** | | **1.3** | | | **1.4** | | **1.5** | | **1.6** | | **1.7** | | **1.8** | | | **1.9** | | **1.10** | |  |  |
| Girard – 2008 [62] | JWD | ● | | ○ | | | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | | 0/4% | | | ● | | ? | | ● | ++ |
| IJZ | ● | | ● | | | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | | 1/2% | | | ● | | ? | | ● | ++ |
| Jakob – 2012 [63] | JWD | ● | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | ● | | ○ | | 1/7% | | | ● | | ? | | ● | - |
| IJZ | ● | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | ○ | | ○ | | 1/7% | | | ● | | ? | | ● | - |
| Pandharipande – 2007 [64] | JWD |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  |  |
| IJZ | ● | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | | ? | | | ● | | ? | | ● | ++ |
| Riker – 2009 [65] | JWD |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  |  |
| IJZ | ● | | ● | | | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | | 3/3% | | | ● | | ● | | ● | ++ |
| Ruokonen – 2009 [66] | JWD |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  |  |
| IJZ | ● | | ? | | | ● | | ● | | ● | | ● | | 25/16% | | | ○ | | ? | | ● | + |
| Schweickert – 2009 [67] | JWD |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  |  |
| IJZ | ● | | ● | | | ○ | | ● | | ● | | ● | | 0/0% | | | ● | | ? | | ● | ++ |
| van Rompaey – 2012 [68] | JWD |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  | |  | |  | | |  | |  | |  |  |
| IJZ | ● | | ● | | | ● | | ○ | | ○ | | ● | | ~90% | | | ● | | n/a | | ● | + |

R = Reviewer (JWD = J.W. Devlin, IJZ = I.J. Zaal, RRvdL = R.R. van de Leur, BvdL = B. van der Lecq); ● = Yes; ○ = No; ? = can’t say;

n/a = Does not apply; ++ = high quality; + = acceptable; - = unacceptable/reject.

**References**

1. Abelha FJ, Fernandes V, Botelho M, Santos P, Santos A, Machado JC, Barros H: **Apolipoprotein E e4 allele does not increase the risk of early postoperative delirium after major surgery**. *Journal of anesthesia* 2012.

2. Agarwal V, O'Neill PJ, Cotton BA, Pun BT, Haney S, Thompson J, Kassebaum N, Shintani A, Guy J, Ely EW *et al*: **Prevalence and risk factors for development of delirium in burn intensive care unit patients**. *Journal of burn care & research : official publication of the American Burn Association* 2010, **31**(5):706-715.

3. Aldemir M, Ozen S, Kara IH, Sir A, Bac B: **Predisposing factors for delirium in the surgical intensive care unit**. *Critical care (London, England)* 2001, **5**(5):265-270.

4. Angles EM, Robinson TN, Biffl WL, Johnson J, Moss M, Tran ZV, Moore EE: **Risk factors for delirium after major trauma**. *American journal of surgery* 2008, **196**(6):864-869; discussion 869-870.

5. Ballestero E, Chapela S, Grassi F, Descotte E, Boedo A, Ferreyra M, Gonzalez A, Lascar F, Lucero P, Molina D: **DELIRIUM IN INTENSIVE CARE UNIT: DEVELOPMENT AND INTERNAL VALIDATION OF PREDICTIVE MODEL**. In: *INTENSIVE CARE MEDICINE: 2013*: SPRINGER 233 SPRING ST, NEW YORK, NY 10013 USA; 2013: S469-S470.

6. Boesen HC, Andersen JH, Bendtsen AO, Jennum PJ: **Sleep and delirium in unsedated patients in the intensive care unit**. *Acta Anaesthesiol Scand* 2016, **60**(1):59-68.

7. Bryczkowski SB, Lopreiato MC, Yonclas PP, Sacca JJ, Mosenthal AC: **Delirium prevention program in the surgical intensive care unit improved the outcomes of older adults**. *J Surg Res* 2014, **190**(1):280-288.

8. Colombo R, Corona A, Praga F, Minari C, Giannotti C, Castelli A, Raimondi F: **A reorientation strategy for reducing delirium in the critically ill. Results of an interventional study**. *Minerva Anestesiol* 2012, **78**(9):1026-1033.

9. Dubois MJ, Bergeron N, Dumont M, Dial S, Skrobik Y: **Delirium in an intensive care unit: a study of risk factors**. *Intensive Care Med* 2001, **27**(8):1297-1304.

10. Ely EW, Girard TD, Shintani AK, Jackson JC, Gordon SM, Thomason JW, Pun BT, Canonico AE, Light RW, Pandharipande P *et al*: **Apolipoprotein E4 polymorphism as a genetic predisposition to delirium in critically ill patients**. *Crit Care Med* 2007, **35**(1):112-117.

11. Girard TD, Ware LB, Bernard GR, Pandharipande PP, Thompson JL, Shintani AK, Jackson JC, Dittus RS, Ely EW: **Associations of markers of inflammation and coagulation with delirium during critical illness**. *Intensive Care Med* 2012, **38**(12):1965-1973.

12. Guenther U, Theuerkauf N, Frommann I, Brimmers K, Malik R, Stori S, Scheidemann M, Putensen C, Popp J: **Predisposing and precipitating factors of delirium after cardiac surgery: a prospective observational cohort study**. *Ann Surg* 2013, **257**(6):1160-1167.

13. Guillamondegui OD, Richards JE, Ely EW, Jackson JC, Archer KR, Archer-Swygert K, Norris PR, Obremskey WT: **Does hypoxia affect intensive care unit delirium or long-term cognitive impairment after multiple trauma without intracranial hemorrhage?** *J Trauma* 2011, **70**(4):910-915.

14. Hayes MG, Kelly AJ, Smith AD: **Working memory and the strategic control of attention in older and younger adults**. *Journals of Gerontology Series B: Psychological Sciences and Social Sciences* 2012, **68**(2):176-183.

15. Heymann A, Sander M, Krahne D, Deja M, Weber-Carstens S, MacGuill M, Kastrup M, Wernecke K, Nachtigall I, Spies C: **Hyperactive delirium and blood glucose control in critically ill patients**. *Journal of International Medical Research* 2007, **35**(5):666-677.

16. Hsieh S, Soto GJ, Pittignano V, Martinez M, Chen J, Ferguson NC, Cheng A, Hope AA, Leung S, Gong MN: **Acute respiratory distress syndrome increases the risk of delirium in critically ill patients**. In: *C55 ACUTE RESPIRATORY DISTRESS SYNDROME.* Am Thoracic Soc; 2013: A4468-A4468.

17. Kamdar BB, Niessen T, Colantuoni E, King LM, Neufeld KJ, Bienvenu OJ, Rowden AM, Collop NA, Needham DM: **Delirium transitions in the medical ICU: Exploring the role of sleep quality and other factors**. *Crit Care Med* 2015, **43**(1):135-141.

18. Kwizera A, Nakibuuka J, Ssemogerere L, Sendikadiwa C, Obua D, Kizito S, Tumukunde J, Wabule A, Nakasujja N: **Incidence and Risk Factors for Delirium among Mechanically Ventilated Patients in an African Intensive Care Setting: An Observational Multicenter Study**. *Crit Care Res Pract* 2015, **2015**:491780.

19. Lat I, McMillian W, Taylor S, Janzen JM, Papadopoulos S, Korth L, Ehtisham A, Nold J, Agarwal S, Azocar R *et al*: **The impact of delirium on clinical outcomes in mechanically ventilated surgical and trauma patients**. *Crit Care Med* 2009, **37**(6):1898-1905.

20. Leite MA, Osaku EF, Costa CR, Candia MF, Toccolini B, Covatti C, Costa NL, Nogueira ST, Ogasawara SM, de Albuquerque CE *et al*: **Delirium during Weaning from Mechanical Ventilation**. *Critical care research and practice* 2014, **2014**:546349.

21. Lescot T, Karvellas CJ, Chaudhury P, Tchervenkov J, Paraskevas S, Barkun J, Metrakos P, Goldberg P, Magder S: **Postoperative delirium in the intensive care unit predicts worse outcomes in liver transplant recipients**. *Canadian Journal of Gastroenterology and Hepatology* 2013, **27**(4):207-212.

22. Limpawattana P, Panitchote A, Tangvoraphonkchai K, Suebsoh N, Eamma W, Chanthonglarng B, Tiamkao S: **Delirium in critical care: a study of incidence, prevalence, and associated factors in the tertiary care hospital of older Thai adults**. *Aging & mental health* 2016, **20**(1):74-80.

23. Lin S-M, Huang C-D, Liu C-Y, Lin H-C, Wang C-H, Huang P-Y, Fang Y-F, Shieh M-H, Kuo H-P: **Risk factors for the development of early-onset delirium and the subsequent clinical outcome in mechanically ventilated patients**. *J Crit Care* 2008, **23**(3):372-379.

24. Lin WL, Chen YF, Wang J: **Factors Associated with the Development of Delirium in Elderly Patients in Intensive Care Units**. *Journal of Nursing Research* 2015, **23**(4):322-329.

25. McGrane S, Girard TD, Thompson JL, Shintani AK, Woodworth A, Ely EW, Pandharipande PP: **Procalcitonin and C-reactive protein levels at admission as predictors of duration of acute brain dysfunction in critically ill patients**. *Critical care (London, England)* 2011, **15**(2):R78.

26. McNicoll L, Pisani MA, Zhang Y, Ely EW, Siegel MD, Inouye SK: **Delirium in the intensive care unit: occurrence and clinical course in older patients**. *J Am Geriatr Soc* 2003, **51**(5):591-598.

27. Mehta S, Cook D, Devlin JW, Skrobik Y, Meade M, Fergusson D, Herridge M, Steinberg M, Granton J, Ferguson N *et al*: **Prevalence, risk factors, and outcomes of delirium in mechanically ventilated adults**. *Crit Care Med* 2015, **43**(3):557-566.

28. Morandi A, Gunther ML, Pandharipande PP, Jackson JC, Thompson JL, Shintani AK, Ely EW, Girard TD: **Insulin-like growth factor-1 and delirium in critically ill mechanically ventilated patients: a preliminary investigation**. *International psychogeriatrics* 2011, **23**(7):1175-1181.

29. Morandi A, Barnett N, Miller RR, 3rd, Girard TD, Pandharipande PP, Ely EW, Ware LB: **Vitamin D and delirium in critically ill patients: a preliminary investigation**. *J Crit Care* 2013, **28**(3):230-235.

30. Ouimet S, Kavanagh BP, Gottfried SB, Skrobik Y: **Incidence, risk factors and consequences of ICU delirium**. *Intensive Care Med* 2007, **33**(1):66-73.

31. Pandharipande P, Shintani A, Peterson J, Pun BT, Wilkinson GR, Dittus RS, Bernard GR, Ely EW: **Lorazepam is an independent risk factor for transitioning to delirium in intensive care unit patients**. *Anesthesiology* 2006, **104**(1):21-26.

32. Pandharipande P, Cotton BA, Shintani A, Thompson J, Pun BT, Morris JA, Dittus R, Ely EW: **Prevalence and risk factors for development of delirium in surgical and trauma intensive care unit patients**. *J Trauma* 2008, **65**(1):34-41.

33. Pandharipande PP, Morandi A, Adams JR, Girard TD, Thompson JL, Shintani AK, Ely EW: **Plasma tryptophan and tyrosine levels are independent risk factors for delirium in critically ill patients**. *Intensive Care Med* 2009, **35**(11):1886-1892.

34. Pisani MA, Murphy TE, Van Ness PH, Araujo KL, Inouye SK: **Characteristics associated with delirium in older patients in a medical intensive care unit**. *Archives of internal medicine* 2007, **167**(15):1629-1634.

35. Pisani MA, Kong SYJ, Kasl SV, Murphy TE, Araujo KLB, Van Ness PH: **Days of delirium are associated with 1-year mortality in an older intensive care unit population**. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2009, **180**(11):1092-1097.

36. Robinson TN, Raeburn CD, Tran ZV, Angles EM, Brenner LA, Moss M: **Postoperative delirium in the elderly: risk factors and outcomes**. *Annals of surgery* 2009, **249**(1):173-178.

37. Saporito A, Sturini E: **Incidence of postoperative delirium is high even in a population without known risk factors**. *Journal of anesthesia* 2014, **28**(2):198-201.

38. Schreiber MP, Colantuoni E, Bienvenu OJ, Neufeld KJ, Chen K-F, Shanholtz C, Mendez-Tellez PA, Needham DM: **Corticosteroids and transition to delirium in patients with acute lung injury**. *Crit Care Med* 2014, **42**(6):1480-1486.

39. Serafim RB, Dutra MF, Saddy F, Tura B, de Castro JEC, Villarinho LC, da Gloria Santos M, Bozza FA, Rocco JR: **Delirium in postoperative nonventilated intensive care patients: risk factors and outcomes**. *Ann Intensive Care* 2012, **2**(1):51.

40. Seymour CW, Pandharipande PP, Koestner T, Hudson LD, Thompson JL, Shintani AK, Ely EW, Girard TD: **Diurnal sedative changes during intensive care: impact on liberation from mechanical ventilation and delirium**. *Crit Care Med* 2012, **40**(10):2788-2796.

41. Sharshar T, Porcher R, Siami S, Rohaut B, Bailly-Salin J, Hopkinson NS, Clair B, Guidoux C, Iacobone E, Sonneville R *et al*: **Brainstem responses can predict death and delirium in sedated patients in intensive care unit**. *Crit Care Med* 2011, **39**(8):1960-1967.

42. Shehabi Y, Riker RR, Bokesch PM, Wisemandle W, Shintani A, Ely EW, Group SS: **Delirium duration and mortality in lightly sedated, mechanically ventilated intensive care patients**. *Crit Care Med* 2010, **38**(12):2311-2318.

43. Shehabi Y, Bellomo R, Reade MC, Bailey M, Bass F, Howe B, McArthur C, Murray L, Seppelt IM, Webb S *et al*: **Early goal-directed sedation versus standard sedation in mechanically ventilated critically ill patients: a pilot study**. *Crit Care Med* 2013, **41**(8):1983-1991.

44. Shi CM, Wang DX, Chen KS, Gu XE: **Incidence and risk factors of delirium in critically ill patients after non-cardiac surgery**. *Chinese medical journal* 2010, **123**(8):993-999.

45. Simons KS, Workum JD, Slooter AJC, van den Boogaard M, van der Hoeven JG, Pickkers P: **Effect of preadmission sunlight exposure on intensive care unit-acquired delirium: a multicenter study**. *J Crit Care* 2014, **29**(2):283-286.

46. Skrobik Y, Leger C, Cossette M, Michaud V, Turgeon J: **Factors predisposing to coma and delirium: fentanyl and midazolam exposure; CYP3A5, ABCB1, and ABCG2 genetic polymorphisms; and inflammatory factors**. *Crit Care Med* 2013, **41**(4):999-1008.

47. Sommer BR, Wise LC, Kraemer HC: **Is dopamine administration possibly a risk factor for delirium?** *Crit Care Med* 2002, **30**(7):1508-1511.

48. Svenningsen H, Egerod I, Videbech P, Christensen D, Frydenberg M, Tonnesen EK: **Fluctuations in sedation levels may contribute to delirium in ICU patients**. *Acta anaesthesiologica Scandinavica* 2013, **57**(3):288-293.

49. Takeuchi M, Takeuchi H, Fujisawa D, Miyajima K, Yoshimura K, Hashiguchi S, Ozawa S, Ando N, Shirahase J, Kitagawa Y *et al*: **Incidence and risk factors of postoperative delirium in patients with esophageal cancer**. *Annals of surgical oncology* 2012, **19**(12):3963-3970.

50. Tsuruta R, Nakahara T, Miyauchi T, Kutsuna S, Ogino Y, Yamamoto T, Kaneko T, Kawamura Y, Kasaoka S, Maekawa T: **Prevalence and associated factors for delirium in critically ill patients at a Japanese intensive care unit**. *General hospital psychiatry* 2010, **32**(6):607-611.

51. van den Boogaard M, Pickkers P, Slooter AJC, Kuiper MA, Spronk PE, van der Voort PHJ, van der Hoeven JG, Donders R, van Achterberg T, Schoonhoven L: **Development and validation of PRE-DELIRIC (PREdiction of DELIRium in ICu patients) delirium prediction model for intensive care patients: observational multicentre study**. *BMJ* 2012, **344**:e420.

52. van den Boogaard M, Schoonhoven L, Maseda E, Plowright C, Jones C, Luetz A, Sackey PV, Jorens PG, Aitken LM, van Haren FMP *et al*: **Recalibration of the delirium prediction model for ICU patients (PRE-DELIRIC): a multinational observational study**. *Intensive Care Med* 2014, **40**(3):361-369.

53. Van Rompaey B, Elseviers MM, Schuurmans MJ, Shortridge-Baggett LM, Truijen S, Bossaert L: **Risk factors for delirium in intensive care patients: a prospective cohort study**. *Crit Care* 2009, **13**(3):R77.

54. Veiga D, Luis C, Parente D, Fernandes V, Botelho M, Santos P, Abelha F: **Postoperative delirium in intensive care patients: risk factors and outcome**. *Rev Bras Anestesiol* 2012, **62**(4):469-483.

55. Wassenaar A, van den Boogaard M, van Achterberg T, Slooter AJC, Kuiper MA, Hoogendoorn ME, Simons KS, Maseda E, Pinto N, Jones C *et al*: **Multinational development and validation of an early prediction model for delirium in ICU patients**. *Intensive Care Med* 2015, **41**(6):1048-1056.

56. Whitlock EL, Torres BA, Lin N, Helsten DL, Nadelson MR, Mashour GA, Avidan MS: **Postoperative delirium in a substudy of cardiothoracic surgical patients in the BAG-RECALL clinical trial**. *Anesthesia and analgesia* 2014, **118**(4):809-817.

57. Wolters AE, Zaal IJ, Veldhuijzen DS, Cremer OL, Devlin JW, Van Dijk D, Slooter AJC: **Anticholinergic Medication Use and Transition to Delirium in Critically Ill Patients: A Prospective Cohort Study**. *Crit Care Med* 2015, **43**(9):1846-1852.

58. Adams Wilson JR, Morandi A, Girard TD, Thompson JL, Boomershine CS, Shintani AK, Ely EW, Pandharipande PP: **The association of the kynurenine pathway of tryptophan metabolism with acute brain dysfunction during critical illness\***. *Crit Care Med* 2012, **40**(3):835-841.

59. Yoshitaka S, Egi M, Morimatsu H, Kanazawa T, Toda Y, Morita K: **Perioperative plasma melatonin concentration in postoperative critically ill patients: its association with delirium**. *J Crit Care* 2013, **28**(3):236-242.

60. Zaal IJ, Slooter AJC: **Delirium in critically ill patients: epidemiology, pathophysiology, diagnosis and management**. *Drugs* 2012, **72**(11):1457-1471.

61. Zhang Z, Pan L, Deng H, Ni H, Xu X: **Prediction of delirium in critically ill patients with elevated C-reactive protein**. *J Crit Care* 2014, **29**(1):88-92.

62. Girard TD, Kress JP, Fuchs BD, Thomason JWW, Schweickert WD, Pun BT, Taichman DB, Dunn JG, Pohlman AS, Kinniry PA *et al*: **Efficacy and safety of a paired sedation and ventilator weaning protocol for mechanically ventilated patients in intensive care (Awakening and Breathing Controlled trial): a randomised controlled trial**. *Lancet* 2008, **371**(9607):126-134.

63. Jakob SM, Ruokonen E, Grounds RM, Sarapohja T, Garratt C, Pocock SJ, Bratty JR, Takala J, Dexmedetomidine for Long-Term Sedation I: **Dexmedetomidine vs midazolam or propofol for sedation during prolonged mechanical ventilation: two randomized controlled trials**. *JAMA* 2012, **307**(11):1151-1160.

64. Pandharipande PP, Pun BT, Herr DL, Maze M, Girard TD, Miller RR, Shintani AK, Thompson JL, Jackson JC, Deppen SA *et al*: **Effect of sedation with dexmedetomidine vs lorazepam on acute brain dysfunction in mechanically ventilated patients: the MENDS randomized controlled trial**. *JAMA* 2007, **298**(22):2644-2653.

65. Riker RR, Shehabi Y, Bokesch PM, Ceraso D, Wisemandle W, Koura F, Whitten P, Margolis BD, Byrne DW, Ely EW *et al*: **Dexmedetomidine vs midazolam for sedation of critically ill patients: a randomized trial**. *JAMA* 2009, **301**(5):489-499.

66. Ruokonen E, Parviainen I, Jakob SM, Nunes S, Kaukonen M, Shepherd ST, Sarapohja T, Bratty JR, Takala J: **Dexmedetomidine versus propofol/midazolam for long-term sedation during mechanical ventilation**. *Intensive Care Med* 2009, **35**(2):282-290.

67. Schweickert WD, Pohlman MC, Pohlman AS, Nigos C, Pawlik AJ, Esbrook CL, Spears L, Miller M, Franczyk M, Deprizio D *et al*: **Early physical and occupational therapy in mechanically ventilated, critically ill patients: a randomised controlled trial**. *Lancet* 2009, **373**(9678):1874-1882.

68. Van Rompaey B, Elseviers MM, Van Drom W, Fromont V, Jorens PG: **The effect of earplugs during the night on the onset of delirium and sleep perception: a randomized controlled trial in intensive care patients**. *Crit Care* 2012, **16**(3):R73.