| Author | Year of publication | Title Country | Type of study Perspective N for Cl | group NH cont | trol Exclusion criteria | Mean Age at testing in years (SD) | Age at identification in months (SD) | Mean Age at first implantation | % bilateral | Gender Female % | Mean IQ (SD) | Family variables | Family variable measures | Language outcomes linguistic dimension | Language meassures | Main results |
|------------------|---------------------|--|-------------------------------------|---------------|---|--|--|--|---------------------|--|--|---|---|---|--|---|
| Boons et al. | 2012 | Predictors of spoken language development Belgium following pediatric cochlear implantation | Cross-sectional Retrospective 288 | No | Cognitive impairment (<80) | n.a. | 9 (8) | in months (SD) 26.4 (13.2) | 18.8 (3 yr after | 47 | n.a. | Family involvement | Binary scale: parental involvement in rehabilitation | Vocabulary expressive Grammar expressive | SELT Word development SELT Sentence development | Family involvement (complicance) correlates sig. pos. with receptive language and world development two and three year after CI and non sig. pos. with sentence development |
| Boons et al. | 2013 | Expressive vocabulary, morphology, syntax and Belgium namative skills in profoundly deaf children after The Netherlan early cochlear implantation | Cross-sectional Prospective 70 nds | Yes | Cognitive impairment (<80) | 8;2 (MEDIAN), 3;10 (IQI | R) n.a. | 21.6 (MEDIAN) 22.8 (IQR) | first CI) 39 | 56 | n.a. | Family involvement Maternal education level | Expert questionnaire: Calderon 2000 Binary (high achool or college/university) | Global receptive Vocabulary expressive Vocabulary others Grammar expressive | RDLS receptive Expressive One Word Picture Vocabulary Test CELF Word Structure CELF formulating sentences | Family involvement correlates sig. pos. with all language outcomes |
| Ceh et al. | 2013 | Early literacy gains in children with USA cochlear implants | Cross-sectional Prospective 39 | No | Implanted >24 months | 5.78 (1.4) | 5.7 (5) | 15 (3.6) | n.a. | 56 | n.a. | Parental linguistic input quantity Parental linguistic input quality Parental income level | Frequency exposure to books Use of open ended questions while book reading income and parent arturation | Social conversational skills Global receptive | Renfrew Language Scale (Bus Story) OWLS or RDLS | Frequency of exposure to books at home and parental use of open ended questions correlate sig. pos. with language outcomes |
| Chen et al. | 2015 | A structural equation modeling approach to examining factors influencing outcomes with cochlear implant in mandarin speaking children | ina Cross-sectional Prospective 115 | No | Cognitive impairment Muttingualism No other comorbidities bilateral Cl | 4.16 (1.05) | n.e. | 32.04 (12.96) | 0 | n.a. | n.a. | Parental income level Maternal education level | and parent education Years of education | Speech perception Vocabulary expressive | Single speech perception score (MAIS, MESP, MPSI) Total vocabulary score (Chinese CDI, CCDI, MERVT) | Direct and indirect effects of MEL on vocabulary (via age at implantation) Indirect effect of MEL on speech perception (via age at implantation) |
| Cruz et al. | 2013 | Identification of effective strategies to promote USA language in deaf children with cochlear implants | Longitudinal Prospective 93 | Yes | Cognitive impairment <70 (Bayley) or <86 (Leiter) Multifrioualism | 1.22 (0.48) | 5.14 (5.36) | 16.5 (4.78) | n.a. | 46 | n.a. | Parental linguistic input quality Parental income level | FLTs, MLUs, different word types Parental income | Global receptive Global expressive | RDLS verbal comprehension RDLS expressive language scale | Number of different word types correlates sig: pos. with receptive language Higher level FLT correlate sig: pos. with expressive language |
| Cuda et al. | 2014 | Pre-school chidren have better spoken language Italy when early implanted | Cross-sectional Retrospective 30 | No | Mutainguation No other comorbidities Mutalingualism Cognitive impairment Etiology other than connexin 26 mutation | 3 | 3.7 (1.4) | 11.8 (3.2) | 10 | 57 | n.a. | Maternal education level | University, High School, Middle School | Vocabulary expressive Grammar expressive Grammar expressive | MCDI MCDI sentence complexity MCDI mean of three longest utterances | MEL correlates sig. pos. with child sentence complexity |
| Cupples et al. | 2016 | Language and speech outcomes of children with Australia hearing loss and additional disabilities: identifying the variables that influence performance at five years of age | Cross-sectional Prospective 49 | Yes | No other comorbidities | n.a. | n.a. | 20 (13.1) | | n.e. | n.a. | Maternal education level Parental income level | University, diploma or certificate, s12 years of schooling IRSAD | Speech production Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive | DEAP (subtest phonology) PPVT-4 CDI-receptive & PLS-4 receptive CDI expressive & PLS-4 expressive | MEL correlated non sig, pos. with language outcomes |
| DesJardin et al. | 2009 | years of age Literacy skills in children with cochlear implants: USA the importance of early oral language and joint storybook reading | Longitudinal Prospective 16 | No | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities | 4.42 (1.05) | 9.8 (6.71) | 25.9 (6.93) | n.a. | 56 | n.a. | Parental linguistic input quality Parental income level Maternal education level | FLTs during story book reading Household annual income Elementary, high school, college, post graduate | Vocabulary expressive | OWLS | Parental use of recasts correlates sig. pos. with child onal vocabulary |
| Geers et al. | 2003 | Language skills of children with early cochlear USA implantation Canada | Cross-sectional Retrospective 181 | Yes | Cognitive impairment Mutilingualism Other comorbidities | 8.11 (0.6) | 4 (8) | 41 (10) | n.a. | 50 | 102 (14.5) | Family involvement (participation in therapy) Parental income level Family size | Parent questionnaire Standardized sum of the ratings for family income and education | Global expressive | Composite Score (IPSyn NP, IPSyn VP, IPSyn QN, IPSyn SS, Types, Morph, WD/Utt) | Smaller farrily size and parental income level correlated sig. pos. with spoken language and total language (controlled for child age, age at implant, age at onset, gender, IO) |
| Geers et al. | 2009 | Spoken language scores of children using USA cochlear implants compared to hearing age mates at school entry | Cross-sectional Prospective 153 | No | Cognitive impairments/10 Age at onset >20 months Duration of Cl use >12 months Not enrolled in auditory verbal interventic | 5.1 (0.6) on | 2.09 (5.75) | 28 (11) | 2.6 | n.a. | 106.8 (15.5) | Parental education level | All family members Highest parent education in years | Vocabulary expressive Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive | EOWPVT or EVT PPVT or ROWPVT CELF receptive CELF expressive | MEL correlates sig. pos. with expressive and receptive vocabulary and receptive and expressive language (controlled for gender, age at implant, PIO) |
| Geers et al. | 2011 | Epilogue: factors contributing to long-term USA outcomes of cochlear implantation in early Canada | Longitudinal Prospective 112 | Yes | programs Cognitive impairment <70 Multilingualism Other comorbidities | 16.7 (0.6) | n.e. | 39.6 | n.a. | 53 | 103.1 | Parental education level Family size | In years All family members | Speech perception | Composite Score CI-E (LNT, Average ESP, BKB Sentences, WIPI) Commosite Score CI-HS (INT, RKR Sentences must, RKR | Smaller family size and parental income level correlate sig. pos. with speech perception, speech production, language (controlled for gender, PIQ) |
| | | childhood | | | Other comorbidities | | | | | | | | | Speech production | Composite Score CTHS (IN1, BKB Sentences quert, BRB sentences noise) Composite Score CT-E (High context keywords, low context keywords, transcribed consonant production, use of speech questionnaire) | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | Global expressive receptive combined | Composite Score CI-HS (High context keywords noise, low context keywords noise, high context keywords understood, low context keywords understood, transcribed consonant production Composite Score CI-E (WISC similarities, different words/minut) | |
| Guerzoni et al. | 2016 | Social conversational skills development in early Italy implanted children | Cross-sectional Prospective 28 | No | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities Cl >2 year <12 months Cl opperience other than auditory verbal therapy. Hearing impaired parents, treer ear molformations. | 2.16 (0.38) | 4.9 (3.9) | 13.3 (4.2) | 18 | 46 | n.a. | Parental education level | Number of years legally required | Vocabulary expressive Social conversational | MCDI Words and Sentences Social Conversational Skills rating scale | MEL correlate non, sig. pos. with vocabulary and social conversational |
| Holt & Svirsky | 2008 | An exploratory look at pediatric cochiear USA implantation: is earliest always best | Longitudinal Prospective 96 | No | ear maiformations Cognitive impairment Other comorbidities | n.e. | 0 | Group1: 10.2 Group2: 18.6 Group 3: 29.9 Group 4: 40.8 | | Group1: 50 Group2: 41 Group3: 49 Group4: 48 | n.a. | Parental income level | Indirect measure of family income TIGER database | Speech perception Global receptive Global expressive | Mr Potato Head Word recognition RDLS III receptive or MCDI RDLS III expressive or MCDI | Parental income level correlates sig. pos. with receptive vocabulary (controlled for age at implantation) |
| Holt et al. | 2013 | Developmental effects of family environment on USA outcomes in pediatric cochlear implant recipients | Cross-sectional Retrospective 59 | No | Cognitive impairment Other comorbidities | Preschool: 3.3 (1.2) School: 10.7 (3.5) | n.e. | Preschool: 16.8 (7.2) School: 31.2 (16.8) | 30.5 | Preschoot 35 Schoot 49 | n.a. | Family values Family relationships Maternal education level | FES FES family relationships <high <="" bachelor,="" bachelor<="" high="" school,="" td=""><td>Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive</td><td>PPVT-4 PLS-4 comprehension PLS-4 expressive</td><td>Lower levels of control and higher levels of organisation within the family correlate sig. pos. with larger receptive vocabularies</td></high> | Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive | PPVT-4 PLS-4 comprehension PLS-4 expressive | Lower levels of control and higher levels of organisation within the family correlate sig. pos. with larger receptive vocabularies |
| Huber & Kipman | 2012 | Cognitive skills and academic achievement of Austria deaf children with cochlear implants | Cross-sectional Prospective 40 | Yes | Onset of deafness later than 24 months Hearing experiences with CI below 3 year | | 85% congenitally deaf | 27.6 (14.4) | 37.5 | 53 | <8.5y=102.7 (13.7) >8.5y=104.2 (12.8) | Parental education level | Education level father and mother 4 levels Skill level father and mother | Global expressive receptive combined Vocabulary expressive | PLS-4 or CELF HAWIK-3 vocabulary | Maternal skill level correlated non. sig. pos. with vocabulary expressive |
| Ketelaar et al. | 2017 | Children with oochlear implants and their The Netherlan parents: relations between parenting style and childrens social-emotional functioning | nds Cross-sectional Prospective 46 | Yes | No exclusion criteria | 3.14 (1.18) | n.a. | 16 (6.7) | 50 | 39 | Gross motor: 0.68 (0.23) Fine motor: 0.65 (0.22) on CDI | Parenting style Parental income level Maternal enteration level | positive parenting scale, negative parenting scale, uninvolved parenting scale Net household income A levels | Vocabulary expressive Grammar expressive Global receptive Global empossive | SELT word production SELT sentence production CDI comprehension and Reynell Comprehension CDI compression | Negative parenting and uninvolved parent affect correlate with language comprehension MEL correlates non. sig. neg. with global expressive language |
| Klein & Wie | 2015 | Long-term predictors of narrative skill in children Norway with early bilateral cochlear implants | Longitudinal Prospective 21 | Yes | Cognitive impairment Other comorbidities Not implanted bilateral simultaneously between 2004 and 2007 in Norway | 7.05 (0.3) | n.a. | 11.5 (4.1) | 100 | 48 | n.a. | Family involvement Parental linguistic input quantity Mode of communication | Frequency of parent courseling Amount of parent focus on speaking and listening Primary oral mode of parental communication | Social conversational | Renfrew Bus story | Parent spoken language focus and frequency of parent counseling at 9 months and use of auditory verbal language correlate sig. pos. with narrative skills |
| Moreno-Torres e | t al. 2016 | Sensitive periods and language in cochlear Spain implant users | Longitudinal Prospective 14 | Yes | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities | n.e. | within first 3 months of life | 17.2 (2.2) | 28.57 | 36 | n.a. | Family involvement Maternal education level | Moeller Family Participation Rating Scale 3 levels | Speech production Vocabulary expressive Grammar expressive | Combination 4 tasks MacArthur parental questionnaire Sentence renetition | Parental education correlates non. sig. pos. with vocabulary (12 months) and phonology (24 months) and correlates sig. pos. with paramete (36 months) Family involvement correlates sig. pos. with articulation, vocabulary and grammer |
| Murri et al. | 2015 | Narrative abilities in early implanted children Italy | Cross-sectional Retrospective 30 | No | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities | 5.25 (0.02) | 7.2 (5.2) | 14.7 (5.3) | 26.7 | 70 | n.a. | Parental education level | In years | Social conversational | Renfrew Bus Story Total information score, mean length of sentences, complexity | Parinty involvement contained ag, pos. with an occasion, vocasculary and grammar MEL correlates sig. pos. with narrative complexity |
| Quittner et al. | 2013 | Effects of maternal sensitivity and cognitive and USA linguistic stimulation on cochlear implant users language development over four years | Longitudinal Prospective 188 | Yes | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism | 2.22 (1.21) | 10.56 (10.56) | n.a. | n.a. | 52 | 96.5 (21.2) | Parenting style Parental income level Parental education level | Videotapes household income >50,000 5 levels | Global expressive receptive combined | CDI Words and Gestures+CDI Words and Sentences +RDLS Verbal Comprehension | Maternal sensitivity and linguistic simulation predicts increases in oral language growth Linguistic stimulation is related to language growth only in context of high maternal sensitivity |
| Rüter | 2011 | Influence of expansions on grammar acquisition. Germany in children with cochlear implants | Longitudinal Prospective 21 | No | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities Bilateral (deaf/HoH parents) | n.a | n.a. | 30 | - | 52 | n.a. | Parental linguistic input quantity | CHLDES | Grammar expressive | CHILDES transcriptions of spontaneous language | Parental expansions correlates sig. pos. with child grammar acquisition |
| Sarant & Garran | | Parenting stress in parents of children with Australia cochlear implants: relationships among parent stress, child language and unilateral versus bilateral implants | Cross-sectional Prospective 70 | No | Cognitive impairment | 6.6 (1.4) | 7.5 (7.5) | 18.6 (9.6) | | 49 | 104.3 (12.3) | Family involvement Parental stress Parental education level | Moeller Family Participation Rating Scale Parental Stress Index Parent higher education 6 levels | Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive Global expressive receptive combined | PPVT-4 PLS-4 PLS-4 EL PLS-4 total language; CELF-4 Core | Parent stress levels correlate sig, neg, with language outcomes Family involvement correlates sig, pos. with language outcomes |
| Sarant et al. | 2014 | Bilateral versus unilateral cochlear implants in Australia children: a study of spoken language outcomes | Cross-sectional Prospective 91 | No | | n.e. | 6.68 (7.46) | Bilateral: 16.44 (9) Unilateral: 23.88 (9.96) | | 52 | Bilateral: 105.36 (13.13) Unilateral: 103.67 (12.07) | Family involvement Parental linguistic input quantity Parental education level Screen time | Moeller Family Participation Rating Scale Adult reading time Tertiary educated Hours/week | Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive Global expressive receptive combined | PPVT-4 PLS-4 PLS-4 EL PLS-4 Total Language; CELF-4 Core | High parental involvement, low screen time and more time spend reading to children correlate pos. with vocabulary and language outcomes |
| Szagun | 1997 | A longitudinal study of the acquisition of Germany language by two German-speaking children with cochlear implants and of their mothers' speech | Longitudinal Retrospective 2 | No | | 3.10 | 0.8 | 2.9 | | 50 | na. | Parental linguistic input quality | mothers degree of exaggerated intonation degree of clarity of segmentation frequency of pragmatic categories | Grammar expressive Social conversational | | is Substantial differences in child language outcomes and mother's speech between the two cases. No indication for a direct influence of maternal language on children's language development, since changes in maternal language do not precede developmental changes in child language. |
| Szagun & Stump | | Age or experience? The influence of age at Germany implantation and social and linguistic environmen on language development in children with oochlear implants | Longitudinal Prospective 25 | No | n.a. | n.a. | 0 | 20.4 (11) | | 48 | n.a. | Parental linguistic input quality Maternal education level | CHILDES parental expansions Maternal education 4 levels | Vocabulary expressive Grammar expressive Grammar receptive | CDH-CHILDES wordtypes CDI MLU | Higher MEL, maternal MLU and maternal expansions correlate sig. pos. with child linguistic progress (independently of age at Cl) |
| Szagun & Schra | | Sources of variability in language development of Germany children with conhear implants: age at implantation, parental language, and early features of childrens language construction | Longitudinal Prospective 48 | No | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities | n.a. | n.a. | 24 (1.2) | | 50 | n.a. | Parental linguistic input quality | Parental expansions | Vocabulary expressive Grammar expressive | Type frequencies of lexical words MLU in morphemes Type and toke frequencies of determiners | Parental expansions at 11 to 12 months post C1 correlate sig. pos. with child MLU at 24 at 30 months post C1 (controlled for age at implantation) |
| Yanbay et al. | 2014 | Language outcomes for children with cochlear Australia implants enrolled in different communication programs | Longitudinal Retrospective 42 | No | Cognitive impairment Multilingualism Other comorbidities | AO: 4.86 (1.16) SS: 4.65 (1.18) AVT: 4.78 (1.19) | AO: 5.04 (4.56) SS: 8.16 (8.04) AVT: 4.08 (5.28) | AO: 14.52 (8.64) SS: 18.36 (9.6) AVT: 12.48 (5.76) | 70.45 | 55 | n.a. | Family involvement Parental income level | Moeller Family Participation Rating Scale IRSAD | Vocabulary receptive Global receptive Global expressive | PPVT-4 PLS-4 PLS-4 EC | Family involvement correlates sig. pos. with all language outcomes Parental income level correlates non sig. pos. with expressive communication |

AD-wallery-wait, NT-endatory-waits francy (NT-endatory-waits francy (N